

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

June 15, 2022

HDRC CASE NO: 2022-316
ADDRESS: 418 KINGS COURT
LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 3090 BLK 6 LOT S IRR 59.4 FT OF W IRR 123 FT OF 1 OR A
ZONING: R-4, H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 1
DISTRICT: Monte Vista Historic District
APPLICANT: John Galan/Ideal Precision
OWNER: LUKEFOUR18 LLC
TYPE OF WORK: Roof and siding replacement
APPLICATION RECEIVED: May 12, 2022
60-DAY REVIEW: Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
CASE MANAGER: Claudia Espinosa

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace roof with standing seam galvalume metal roof.
2. Replace aluminum siding with composite lap siding and paint it the same color.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.
- ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or stripping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing.
- iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.
- iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See *General Paint Type Recommendations* in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.
- v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Facade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
- ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
- iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

2. Materials: Masonry and Stucco

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Paint*—Avoid painting historically unpainted surfaces. Exceptions may be made for severely deteriorated material where other consolidation or stabilization methods are not appropriate. When painting is acceptable, utilize a water permeable paint to avoid trapping water within the masonry.
- ii. *Clear area*—Keep the area where masonry or stucco meets the ground clear of water, moisture, and vegetation.
- iii. *Vegetation*—Avoid allowing ivy or other vegetation to grow on masonry or stucco walls, as it may loosen mortar and stucco and increase trapped moisture.
- iv. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible to clean masonry and stucco when needed, as improper cleaning can damage the surface. Avoid the use of any abrasive, strong chemical, sandblasting, or high-pressure cleaning method.

3. Materials: Roofs

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Regular maintenance and cleaning*—Avoid the build-up of accumulated dirt and retained moisture. This can lead to the growth of moss and other vegetation, which can lead to roof damage. Check roof surface for breaks or holes and flashing for open seams and repair as needed.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.
- ii. *Roof form*—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary.
- iii. *Roof features*—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends.
- iv. *Materials: sloped roofs*—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible.
- v. *Materials: flat roofs*—Allow use of contemporary roofing materials on flat or gently sloping roofs not visible from the public right-of-way.
- vi. *Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof.
- vii. *Roof vents*—Maintain existing historic roof vents. When deteriorated beyond repair, replace roof vents in-kind or with one similar in design and material to those historically used when in-kind replacement is not possible.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 418 Kings Court is a one-story, single-family residence that was constructed circa 1920 and contributes to the Monte Vista Historic District, and is found on the 1924 Sanborn Map. The structure currently features a shingle roof and metal siding. At this time the applicant has proposed to install a new, standing seam metal roof and to remove the existing, aluminum siding and install metal siding.
- b. **ROOF REPLACEMENT** – The applicant has proposed to install a new, standing seam metal roof. The 1924 Sanborn Map notes a composition roof. The structure features Craftsman architectural elements and standing seam metal roofs are found within the Monte Vista Historic District on Craftsman style structures. Staff finds the standing seam metal roof installation to be appropriate; however, staff finds that the proposed roof should feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam, and a standard galvalume finish. Panels should be smooth.
- c. **SIDING REPLACEMENT** – The applicant has proposed for the current aluminum siding to be removed and replaced with a smooth finished composite siding. Per the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 1.B.ii. composite materials such as Hardi siding should not be used on historic structures. Staff finds the proposed installation to be inappropriate and inconsistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends approval of item #1, roof replacement with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the proposed standing seam metal roof should feature smooth panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam or a low profile ridge cap and a standard galvalume finish. If a ridge cap is proposed, it must be submitted for review and approval.
 - ii. That all original roof elements, including chimneys and flues be preserved.
 - iii. A standing seam metal roof inspection is to be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that roofing materials are consistent with approved design. An industrial ridge cap is not to be used.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the installation of composite siding to replace the non-original aluminum siding. Staff recommends the applicant repair the original siding that is beneath the existing aluminum siding. If no original siding remains, staff recommends wood siding be installed that is both architecturally and period appropriate.

City of San Antonio One Stop



June 9, 2022













